| **Student Name:** Audrey Lai |
| --- |

| **Motion:** This house would establish vocational schools and aggressively stream underperforming students into them |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 71 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| **Teacher comments:**  [NOTE: Today’s speeches are 8 minutes’ long.]  Excellent job phrasing the hook, good use of rhetoric and emotionally evocative phrases!  On the lack of autonomy:   * This is a LATE clarification that students actually do have some autonomy in choosing which vocational schools they go to, but so incredibly important.   + Point out that if the problem was vocational schools are under-funded, then it’s because they lack students! With Prop’s modelling, there is greater impetus for the state to drastically improve funding for vocational schools. * Good job making the comparison that it’s not like things are any better in traditional schools, but relate it back to the point of autonomy. Conclude clearly that they never had any real or meaningful choices anyways in a system that is designed for them to fail!   Before we go to your argument, we should’ve called out Opp’s failing strategy!   * Their main argument is these students would have gone to vocational schools anyways.   + Then everything is symmetrical, and there’s no material difference in outcomes, so Opp has no nett additional harm in the debate. * Since Opp argued that parents, teachers and friends pressure these students to enroll, then Opp also violates their autonomy! Opp’s winning pathway is undercut by their own argument.   On the traditional education system designed for them to fail:   * I am not hearing the mechanistic analysis as to why there are INHERENT attributes of the traditional system that can never be compatible with specific TYPES of students.   + E.g. Explain that children with learning disorders do not thrive in exam-oriented settings, and would typically thrive in skills-based hands-on learning.   + E.g. Students all naturally have different types of intelligences, but traditional systems only value the STEM, logic-side of intelligences! If some students have spatial intelligence, enrolling in arts/crafts-type of vocational skills will actually match your natural aptitudes. * Good human costs analysis on why these environments would embed a low sense of self-esteem, but spend even more time expanding the long-term impact of this to the rest of their lives.   I understand the argument on a better future, but Emma has already argued this.   * For the value-add, move on to weigh this against Zak’s argument. Opp is saying that vocational satisfaction is the preferable outcome, that they ought to be happy with the job they chose; why do you think this matters less than making money?   + There’s only a one-liner at the end about going back to their dreams after making money! Was this ever that easy?   Please offer more POIs today!  8.17 | | | | | | |